

OFFICE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY

Doris Flores Brooks, CPA, CGFM Public Auditor

PROCUREMENT APPEALS

IN THE APPEAL OF,

TOWN HOUSE DEPARTMENT STORES,
INC, dba ISLAND BUSINESS SYSTEMS &
SUPPLIES,
Appellant

APPEAL NO: OPA-PA-11-002

DECISION AND ORDER RE DOE'S MOTION TO DISMISS

To: Purchasing Agency:

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

Department of Education, Government of Guam C/O Laura J. Mooney, Esq. GDOE Office of the Superintendent 312 Aspinall Ave. Hagåtña, Guam, 96932 Facsimile: (671) 472-5003

Appellant:

IBSS

C/O John T. Brown, Esq.

P.O. Box 7

Hagåtña, Guam, 96932

Facsimile: (671) 472-6153

Interested Party:

Xerox Corporation C/O Elyze M. Iriarte, Esq. Carlsmith Ball, LLP Bank of Hawaii Bldg., Suite 401 134 West Soledad Ave. Hagåtña, Guam, 96932

Facsimile: (671) 477-4375

THIS MATTER came before the Public Auditor on April 29, 2011 pursuant to the Department of Education, Government of Guam's (Hereafter referred to as "DOE"), Motion to Dismiss. The Public Auditor hereby considers the record on file in this matter to decide this motion to include but not limited to Appellant's Opposition to Appellee DOE's Motion to

6

9

13 14

12

15 16

17

18 19

20

21

22

2425

26 27

28

Decline Appeal filed on May 2, 2011, Interested Party XEROX's Response to DOE's Motion to Dismiss Appeal filed on May 6, 2011, and DOE's Reply in Support of Motion to Dismiss filed on May 6, 2011. After considering the aforementioned record and pleading filed by the parties, the Public Auditor hereby FINDS and ORDERS the following:

- 1. The Public Auditor finds that Town House Department Stores, Inc., dba Island Business Systems & Supplies v. Department of Education, Government of Guam, et. al., Civil Case No. CV1536 (Superior Court of Guam) concerns the procurement that is the subject of this The aforementioned civil action concerns the Appellant in this matter seeking a civil judgment against DOE and others pursuant to the Proper Government Spending Enforcement Act as codified in 5 G.C.A. §7101 et. seq., for DOE's, and other's alleged improper and illegal expenditure of public funds to procure supplies and services in contravention of the procurement laws and regulations, for the period starting from January, 2010 to the present. Further, the specific supplies and services in the aforementioned civil action concern document management services. Here, this appeal concerns the award of DOE-IFB-022-2010 (Document Management Services) to XEROX. Thus, the document management services stated in the aforementioned civil action are the same document management services that DOE awarded to XEROX via DOE-IFB-022-2010. Further, part of the relief Appellant prays for in the aforementioned civil matter is a preliminary and permanent injunction enjoining DOE and others from expending public funds to procure document management services through the use of renewals, extensions, and otherwise in violation of the applicable procurement regulations and laws. Thus, if Appellant is successful obtaining the aforementioned injunctive relief, said relief may very well enjoin and restrain DOE from expending public funds to pay for the document management services XEROX is providing DOE via its award of DOE-IFB-022-2010. Therefore, the aforementioned civil action concerns the document management services awarded to XEROX via DOE-IFB-022-2010 which is the subject of this appeal.
- 2. The Public Auditor shall not take any further action on this appeal. Generally, if an action concerning the procurement under appeal has commenced in court, the Public Auditor shall not act on the appeal except to notify the parties and decline the matter due to judicial involvement. 2 G.A.R., Div. 4, Chap. 12, §12103(b). This procurement regulation specifically

prohibits the Public Auditor from taking any action upon notification of pending judicial proceedings. Harbor Centre Guam Co., Ltd., et. al. v. Doris Flores Brooks as Public Auditor, Office of Public Accountability, SP0226, line 2, page 4, Decision and Order dated April 20, 2011 (Superior Court of Guam). Here, as stated above, Town House Department Stores, Inc., dba Island Business Systems & Supplies v. Department of Education, Government of Guam, et. al., Civil Case No. CV1536 (Superior Court of Guam) concerns the procurement underlying this appeal. Thus, the parties are hereby ON NOTICE of the aforementioned civil action and the Public Auditor shall not take any further action on this appeal and hereby declines taking any further action due to the aforementioned judicial involvement.

- 3. DOE's request for a dismissal of this action is not permissible as a matter of law. A plain interpretation of 2 G.A.R., Div. 4, Chap. 12, §12103(b), and the obvious intent of the plain language used in its terms, is to require the Public Auditor to refrain from any further action in a procurement appeal upon the filing of judicial proceedings, and that the issuance of dismissal with prejudice by the Public Auditor is a derogation of the rule. *Id.*, at line 7, page 5. Thus, DOE is not entitled to a dismissal pursuant to 2 G.A.R., Div. 4, Chap. 12, §12103(b). Further, the Public Auditor must now stay the appeal without taking any further action until the Superior Court of Guam decides *Town House Department Stores, Inc., dba Island Business Systems & Supplies v. Department of Education, Government of Guam, et. al.*, Civil Case No. CV1536 (Superior Court of Guam).
- 4. All pending motions shall be held in abeyance until the aforementioned civil action is decided in the Superior Court of Guam.

SO ORDERED this 13th day of May, 2011 by:

DORIS FLORES BROOKS, CPA, CGFM

Public Auditor

Broadcast Report

Date/Time Local ID 1 Local ID 2

05-16-2011 4727951 04:53:01 p.m.

Transmit Header Text Local Name 1

Local Name 2

OFFICE OF PUBLIC AUDITOR

This document : Confirmed (reduced sample and details below)

Document size: 8.5"x11"



To

Mr. John T. Brown, Esq., Legal Counsel Town House Dept. Stores, Inc. dba Island Business Systems and Supplies (IBSS) (Appellant)

Ms. Laura Mooney, Esq., Legal Counsel Gusm Dept. of Education (GDOE) (Appellee)

Ms. Elyze McDonald-Iriarte, Esq., Legal Counsel Xerox Corporation, Interested Party om: Dorís Flores Brooks, CPA, CGFM

Public Auditor
OPA Procurement Appeals
Suite 401 DNA Bldg,
238 Archbishop Flores St.
Hagatna, Guarn 96910

4 (Including enver)

Agency		•••	ages.	4 (Incomong co	,,,,	
CC:		D	ate:	May 16, 2011		
Fax:	GDOE: 472-5003		wirst of		x 211 (Anne Camacho)	
I a.s.	IBSS: 472-6153 Carlsmith: 47-4375		Contact Nos.	Fax: 472-7951		
Re:	Appeal No. OPA-PA-	II-002 – DECISION AND	ORD	ER re: DOE'S	MOTION TO DISMISS	

Ame Carnacho - <u>scarnacho (Eguamopa org</u>

This facsimile transmission and accompanying documents may contain confidential or privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient of this fax transmission please call our office and notify us immediately. Do not distribute or disclose the contents to anyone. Thank you.

Please acknowledge receipt of this transmittal by re-sending this cover page along with your firm or

Total Pages Scanned: 4

Total Pages Confirmed : 12

agency's receipt stamp, date, and initials of receiver. Thank you.

See attachment for reference.

TOTAL F EIGES OCERTICS : 4		annou. T	Total Fages Committee : 12						
No.	Job	Remote Station	Start Time	Duration	Pages	Line	Mode	Job Type	Results
001	342	6714774375	04:48:12 p.m. 05-16-2011	00:00:53	4/4	1	EC	HS	CP28800
002	342	671 472 6153	04:48:12 p.m. 05-16-2011	00:01:38	4/4	1	EC	HS	CP14400
003	342	671-472-5003	04:48:12 p.m. 05-16-2011	00:00:53	4/4	1	EC	HS	CP31200